



FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
COMBINED CONSENSUS SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements
Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Chair Yelena Semenova

Phase 1 - SOQ

Date: 8/21/2023

Number of Submitting Firms: 3

Firms	Panelist Names					TOTAL PANEL RANKED SCORE	PHASE 1 RANK ORDER
	Yelena Semenova Rank Order	Essa Oro Rank Order	Jerry Boone Rank Order	John Wunsch Rank Order	Valerie Thiel Rank Order		
1 KMB architects	3	3	1	3	3	13	3
2 Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects	2	1	2	1	1	7	1
3 SERA Design & Architecture	1	2	3	2	2	10	2
4							
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							
14							
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							

Phase 2 Interview

Date: 8/29/2023

Number of Firms Interviewed: 3

Firms	RANK ORDER OF COMMITTEE MEMBERS					TOTAL ASSIGNED RANKS	FINAL RANK ORDER
	Yelena Semenova	Essa Oro	Jerry Boone	John Wunsch	Valerie Thiel		
	Rank Order	Rank Order	Rank Order	Rank Order	Rank Order		
1 KMB architects	2	3	1	3	2	11	2
2 SERA Design & Architecture	3	2	3	2	3	13	3
3 Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects	1	1	2	1	1	6	1
4							
5							

Yelena Semenova

Yelena Semenova

Jerry Boone

Jerry Boone

Valerie Thiel

Valerie Thiel

Essa Oro

Essa Oro (Aug 29, 2023 14:02 PDT)

Essa Oro

John Wunsch

John Wunsch (Aug 29, 2023 15:06 PDT)

John Wunsch



FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Consensus Date 8/21/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Yelena Semenova	

CRITERIA	Scores	Diverse Business Equity & Inclusion Strategies	Qualifications of Key Personnel		Relevant Experience		Past Performance						TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
		Yes/ No	Score	35	Score	35	Score	30	Score		Score		Score	
1	KMB architects	Yes	88%	30.80	85%	29.75	87%	26.10					86.65	3
2	Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects	Yes	90%	31.50	87%	30.45	90%	27.00					88.95	2
3	SERA Design & Architecture	Yes	95%	33.25	92%	32.20	80%	24.00					89.45	1
4														
5														
6														
7														
8														
9														
10														
11														
12														
13														
14														
15														
16														
17														
18														
19														
20														

COMMENTS:

Semenova

Yelena Semenova

8/21/2023
Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Consensus Date 8/21/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Essa Oro	

CRITERIA	Qualifications of Key Personnel		Relevant Experience		Past Performance								TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
	Scores	Score	35	Score	35	Score	30	Score		Score		Score		
1 KMB architects		65%	22.75	70%	24.50	75%	22.50						69.75	3
2 Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects		75%	26.25	80%	28.00	80%	24.00						78.25	1
3 SERA Design & Architecture		80%	28.00	70%	24.50	75%	22.50						75.00	2
4														
5														
6														
7														
8														
9														
10														
11														
12														
13														
14														
15														
16														
17														
18														
19														
20														

COMMENTS:

Essa Oro
Essa Oro (Aug 29, 2023 14:02 PDT)
Essa Oro

8/21/2023
Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Consensus Date 8/21/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Jerry Boone	

CRITERIA	Qualifications of Key Personnel		Relevant Experience		Past Performance								TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
	Scores	Score	35	Score	35	Score	30	Score		Score		Score		
1 KMB architects		85%	29.75	91%	31.85	95%	28.50						90.10	1
2 Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects		85%	29.75	90%	31.50	95%	28.50						89.75	2
3 SERA Design & Architecture		85%	29.75	90%	31.50	90%	27.00						88.25	3
4														
5														
6														
7														
8														
9														
10														
11														
12														
13														
14														
15														
16														
17														
18														
19														
20														

COMMENTS:

Jerry Boone
Jerry Boone

8/21/2023
Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Consensus Date 8/21/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member John Wunsch	

CRITERIA	Qualifications of Key Personnel		Relevant Experience		Past Performance								TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
	Score	35	Score	35	Score	30	Score		Score		Score			
1 KMB architects	90%	31.50	89%	31.15	85%	25.50							88.15	3
2 Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects	91%	31.85	90%	31.50	92%	27.60							90.95	1
3 SERA Design & Architecture	92%	32.20	90%	31.50	83%	24.90							88.60	2
4														
5														
6														
7														
8														
9														
10														
11														
12														
13														
14														
15														
16														
17														
18														
19														
20														
COMMENTS:	1. All identified staff well. All have significant experience in scope and size. 2. All have relevant experience. All have undertaken projects of similar scope and size. SWL seems to have more larger projects indicating ability to handle complex projects better. 3. Only SWL indicated they have used and will use these OFM methodologies. While KMB has extensive WA State project history they did not indicate their use of OFM's LCCT. SERA indicates they use a similar tool to OFMS's LCCT. 4. SWL and SERA more fully indicated LEED achievements than did KMB. 5. All describe past performance but again, I see SWL doing a more indepth description of Past Performance and highlighting specific National Guard regulatory references and experiences than SERA or KMB. The other competitor (KMB) did not reference National Guard Bureau (NGB) regulations or planning guidance. To me it shows a greater level of project intent and scope and owner/customer requirements.													

John Wunsch
John Wunsch (Aug 29, 2023 15:06 PDT)
John Wunsch

8/21/2023
Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

**Washington Military Department - Camp Murray
Building 34 Tenant Improvements**

Consensus Date

8/21/2023

Project Number

2023-268

Name of Selection Panel Member

Valerie Thiel

CRITERIA	Qualifications of Key Personnel		Relevant Experience		Past Performance								TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
	Score	35	Score	35	Score	30	Score		Score		Score			
1 KMB architects	80%	24.00	80%	24.00	88%	26.40							74.40	3
2 Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects	98%	29.40	97%	29.10	98%	29.40							87.90	1
3 SERA Design & Architecture	96%	28.80	94%	28.20	88%	26.40							83.40	2
4														
5														
6														
7														
8														
9														
10														
11														
12														
13														
14														
15														
16														
17														
18														
19														
20														
COMMENTS:														

Valerie Thiel

Valerie Thiel

8/21/2023

Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE II - PROPOSAL SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Date of Evaluation 8/29/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Yelena Semenova	

CRITERIA	Weighting	KMB architects		SERA Design & Architecture		Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects					
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Organization	20	90%	18.00	87%	17.40	90%	18.00				
Project Management	25	88%	22.00	85%	21.25	88%	22.00				
Project Approach	20	90%	18.00	83%	16.60	90%	18.00				
Experience	35	85%	29.75	90%	31.50	87%	30.45				
Diverse Business Inclusion Plan (indicate included or not included)	Not Scored	Included		Included		Included					
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	100		87.75		86.75		88.45				
FINAL RANK ORDER			2		3		1				
COMMENTS:											

Semenova

Yelena Semenova

Aug 29, 2023

Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE II - PROPOSAL SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Date of Evaluation 8/29/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Essa Oro	

CRITERIA	Weighting	KMB architects		SERA Design & Architecture		Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects					
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Organization	20	65%	13.00	80%	16.00	75%	15.00				
Project Management	25	70%	17.50	80%	20.00	80%	20.00				
Project Approach	20	70%	14.00	70%	14.00	80%	16.00				
Experience	35	70%	24.50	78%	27.30	80%	28.00				
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	100		69.00		77.30		79.00				
FINAL RANK ORDER			3		2		1				
COMMENTS:											

Essa Oro
Essa Oro (Aug 29, 2023 14:02 PDT)
Essa Oro

Aug 29, 2023
Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE II - PROPOSAL SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Date of Evaluation 8/29/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Jerry Boone	

CRITERIA	Weighting	KMB architects		SERA Design & Architecture		Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects					
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Organization	20	95%	19.00	95%	19.00	95%	19.00				
Project Management	25	93%	23.25	90%	22.50	94%	23.50				
Project Approach	20	95%	19.00	90%	18.00	94%	18.80				
Experience	35	91%	31.85	85%	29.75	90%	31.50				
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	100		93.10		89.25		92.80				
FINAL RANK ORDER			1		3		2				
COMMENTS:											

Jerry Boone

Jerry Boone

Aug 29, 2023

Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE II - PROPOSAL SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Date of Evaluation 8/29/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member John Wunsch	

CRITERIA	Weighting	KMB architects		SERA Design & Architecture		Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects					
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Organization	20	70%	14.00	72%	14.40	77%	15.40				
Project Management	25	52%	13.00	60%	15.00	72%	18.00				
Project Approach	20	55%	11.00	55%	11.00	80%	16.00				
Experience	35	85%	29.75	88%	30.80	88%	30.80				
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	100		67.75		71.20		80.20				
FINAL RANK ORDER			3		2		1				
COMMENTS:											

John Wunsch
John Wunsch (Aug 29, 2023 15:06 PDT)
John Wunsch

Aug 29, 2023
Date



Washington State
DEPARTMENT OF
ENTERPRISE SERVICES

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

CONSULTANT SELECTION
PHASE II - PROPOSAL SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Washington Military Department - Camp Murray Building 34 Tenant Improvements	
Date of Evaluation 8/29/2023	Project Number 2023-268
Name of Selection Panel Member Valerie Thiel	

CRITERIA	Weighting	KMB architects		SERA Design & Architecture		Starling Whitehead & Lux Architects					
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Organization	20	95%	19.00	90%	18.00	96%	19.20				
Project Management	25	95%	23.75	88%	22.00	94%	23.50				
Project Approach	20	92%	18.40	90%	18.00	98%	19.60				
Experience	35	90%	31.50	96%	33.60	96%	33.60				
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	100		92.65		91.60		95.90				
FINAL RANK ORDER			2		3		1				
COMMENTS:											

Valerie Thiel

Valerie Thiel

Aug 29, 2023

Date